



June 10, 2016

Whitney Smith, Procurement Coordinator
Office of Business Affairs
University of Arkansas
Administration Building Rm 321
1125 W. Maple
Fayetteville, AR 72701

Re: RFP 599020 AREON Dark Fiber RFP

Dear Whitney:

The evaluation committee for RFP 599020 has completed its evaluation of the RFP and the Best and Final Offers submitted by all of the vendors. This was a complicated RFP to score due to the fact that we requested proposals on a number of fiber routes (and in some cases with multiple options for a route); for 2, 4, and 6 strands per route; and for 20 and 30 year pricing. The committee evaluated and scored each combination of these factors separately. The accompanying spreadsheet contains the detailed calculations and scoring results for the proposals.

Due to the fact that Atlantic Fiber Networks (AFN) did not submit the requested and required detailed response to the RFP itself, the evaluation committee was unable to fully score AFN's proposal and hereby recommends that the proposal be disqualified.

Category 1: Pricing was scored per the formula published in the RFP in which there is a linear calculation of the proposed and minimum pricing for each combination of route, strands, and years. The price scored was that provided in each vendor's Best and Final Offer with the exception of ROUTE2A for Southwest Arkansas Telephone Coop (SWATC). Since SWATC submitted a higher price in the Best and Final Offer than in its original proposal, the committee chose to use the lower price from the original proposal in the scoring calculation. This is highlighted in light green in the spreadsheet.

Category 2: Factors on the suitability of each route, its resiliency, and the optical characteristics were evaluated and scored individually by each committee member and averaged to produce a score for each route.

Category 3: Factors on the vendor's ability to support the route, its maintenance practices, and the installation were evaluated and scored individually by each committee member and averaged to produce a score for each route.

Category 4: Factors on the vendor's history and past performance, including the submitted financial statements, were evaluated and scored individually by each committee member and averaged to produce a score for each route.

Finally, the scores for Categories 1, 2, 3, and 4 were added to produce a total score for each combination of route, strands, and years. The calculated total scores are in the columns highlighted in light blue in the spreadsheet. The winning proposals for each combination are highlighted in yellow.

Award Recommendations:

Based on current availability of funds, the committee makes only two recommendations on fiber routes to award at this time. Prior to the time of expiration of the bid quotes, we may make recommendations for additional awards if funding can be identified.

Recommendation #1: The committee recommends an award to South Arkansas Telephone Company (SATCO) for ROUTE4C, which is a fiber route between the University of Arkansas at Monticello's Crossett campus to a splice point designated in the RFP as SPLICE4C. The option to award is for 30 years and for 6 strands, for a total cost of \$233,355.00.

Recommendation #2: The committee recommends an award to South Arkansas Telephone Company (SATCO) for ROUTE7C, which is a fiber route between the National Center for Toxicological Research to a splice point designated in the RFP as SPLICE7C. The option to award is for 30 years and for 6 strands, for a total of \$652,000.00.

Thank you for guiding us through the procurement process for this RFP. I will be happy to answer any questions that you may have regarding the evaluations, the process, the results, and or our recommendation. At the appropriate time, we will collect all materials and notes produced during the evaluation and submit them to you as a part of the official record.

Sincerely,



David L. Merrifield

cc: Evaluation Committee:

- Steven Fulkerson
- Scott Ramoly
- David Merrifield

RFP 599020 AREON Dark Fiber IRUs

Evaluation Score BAFO Summary

6/10/2016

				AVERAGE SCORES - CATEGORIES 2-4			INDIVIDUAL EVALUATOR SCORES - CATEGORIES 2-4					
							Steven Fulkerson			David Merrifield		
Vendor	IRU Route Number	A-Endpoint	Z-Endpoint	Fiber Route Suitability, Resiliency, and Optical Characteristics	Vendor Support, Maintenance, and Installation	Vendor History and Past Performance	Fiber Route Suitability, Resiliency, and Optical Characteristics	Vendor Support, Maintenance, and Installation	Vendor History and Past Performance	Fiber Route Suitability, Resiliency, and Optical Characteristics	Vendor Support, Maintenance, and Installation	Vendor History and Past Performance
Maximum Points to Assign --->				30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
Cablesouth	ROUTE1	CCCUA	HOPE	27.72	19.67	10.00	27.15	20.00	10.00	29.00	20.00	10.00
Ritter	ROUTE1	CCCUA	HOPE	27.72	19.67	10.00	27.15	20.00	10.00	29.00	20.00	10.00
SATCO	ROUTE1	CCCUA	HOPE	30.00	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
SWATC	ROUTE1	CCCUA	HOPE	28.67	18.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	28.00	19.00	10.00
Ritter	ROUTE2A	RMCC	CCCUA	27.75	19.67	10.00	27.24	20.00	10.00	29.00	20.00	10.00
SATCO	ROUTE2A	RMCC	CCCUA	30.00	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
SWATC	ROUTE2A	RMCC	CCCUA	29.33	17.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	28.00	19.00	10.00
Cablesouth	ROUTE3B	PCCUA	FRCY	21.59	18.33	8.00	19.77	18.00	10.00	26.00	20.00	8.00
Cablesouth	ROUTE3B	PCCUA	FRCY	30.00	18.33	8.00	30.00	18.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	8.00
Ritter	ROUTE3B	PCCUA	FRCY	25.20	19.67	10.00	25.59	20.00	10.00	27.00	20.00	10.00
SATCO	ROUTE3B	PCCUA	FRCY	29.67	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
Ritter	ROUTE3B & 6	PCCUA & KENN	FRCY & ASUJ	22.77	19.67	10.00	22.30	20.00	10.00	26.00	20.00	10.00
SATCO	ROUTE3D	PCCUA	MNTI	30.00	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
Cablesouth	ROUTE4A	UAMC	MNTI	25.98	18.00	8.00	25.94	18.00	10.00	27.00	20.00	8.00
SATCO	ROUTE4A	UAMC	MNTI	30.00	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
SATCO	ROUTE4B	UAMC	HMBG	30.00	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
Cablesouth	ROUTE4C	UAMC	SPLICE4C	18.33	18.33	8.00	15.00	18.00	10.00	27.00	20.00	8.00
SATCO	ROUTE4C	UAMC	SPLICE4C	29.67	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
Cablesouth	ROUTE5	UAMM	MNTI	30.00	18.33	8.00	30.00	18.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	8.00
SATCO	ROUTE5	UAMM	MNTI	29.67	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
Ritter	ROUTE6	KENN	ASUJ	21.23	19.67	10.00	19.69	20.00	10.00	27.00	20.00	10.00
SATCO	ROUTE6	KENN	ASUJ	29.67	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00
Ritter	ROUTE7A	NCTR	PNBL	25.89	19.67	10.00	24.68	20.00	10.00	28.00	20.00	10.00
Cablesouth	ROUTE7C	NCTR	SPLICE7C	24.67	18.33	8.00	30.00	18.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	8.00
SATCO	ROUTE7C	NCTR	SPLICE7C	30.00	19.67	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00	30.00	20.00	10.00

Notes: Vendor's Proposed Price is based on Best and Final Offer, except for SWATC's ROUTE2A, which was priced HIGHER in the BAFO than in the original RFP proposal. Winning proposals based on final score on each route and each combination of IRU years and numbers of strands are highlighted in yellow.

Scott Ramoly			Calculated Cost Scores - Category 1						CALCULATED TOTAL SCORES - CATEGORIES 1-4						IRU Route Number
Fiber Route Suitability, Resiliency, and Optical Characteristics	Vendor Support, Maintenance, and Installation	Vendor History and Past Performance	20-Year IRU 2 Strands	20-Year IRU 4 Strands	20-Year IRU 6 Strands	30-Year IRU 2 Strands	30-Year IRU 4 Strands	30-Year IRU 6 Strands	20-Year IRU 2 Strands	20-Year IRU 4 Strands	20-Year IRU 6 Strands	30-Year IRU 2 Strands	30-Year IRU 4 Strands	30-Year IRU 6 Strands	
30.00	20.00	10.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00	
27.00	19.00	10.00	23.07	23.12	23.16	24.31	24.31	24.31	80.56	80.56	80.56	86.62	86.62	86.62	ROUTE1
27.00	19.00	10.00	23.07	23.12	23.16	24.31	24.31	24.31	74.23	74.23	74.23	78.01	78.01	78.01	ROUTE1
30.00	19.00	10.00	37.97	38.04	38.11	40.00	40.00	40.00	87.38	87.38	87.38	93.62	93.62	93.62	ROUTE1
28.00	15.00	10.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	33.71	33.66	32.66	96.67	96.67	96.67	96.67	96.67	96.67	ROUTE1
27.00	19.00	10.00	35.76	35.81	35.86	40.00	40.00	40.00	93.27	93.27	94.97	97.41	97.41	97.41	ROUTE2A
30.00	19.00	10.00	23.79	23.83	23.86	26.61	26.61	26.61	83.53	83.53	84.66	86.28	86.28	86.28	ROUTE2A
30.00	14.00	10.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	35.78	35.74	35.71	97.00	97.00	97.00	92.78	92.74	92.71	ROUTE2A
19.00	17.00	6.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	87.92	87.92	87.92	87.92	87.92	87.92	ROUTE3B
30.00	17.00	6.00	34.09	34.09	34.09	36.66	36.66	36.66	87.05	87.05	87.05	88.27	88.27	88.27	ROUTE3B
23.00	19.00	10.00	23.45	23.45	23.45	25.21	25.21	25.21	76.60	76.60	76.60	77.47	77.47	77.47	ROUTE3B
29.00	19.00	10.00	33.29	33.29	33.29	35.80	35.80	35.80	88.31	88.31	88.31	89.47	89.47	89.47	ROUTE3B
20.00	19.00	10.00	22.85	21.74	21.06	21.92	20.74	20.12	75.69	74.51	73.78	74.70	73.44	72.78	ROUTE3B & 6
30.00	19.00	10.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	ROUTE3D
25.00	16.00	6.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	91.98	91.98	91.98	91.98	91.98	91.98	ROUTE4A
30.00	19.00	10.00	24.80	24.80	24.80	26.95	26.95	26.95	84.47	84.47	84.47	85.54	85.54	85.54	ROUTE4A
30.00	19.00	10.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	ROUTE4B
13.00	17.00	6.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	84.67	84.67	84.67	84.67	84.67	84.67	ROUTE4C
29.00	19.00	10.00	34.28	34.28	34.28	37.71	37.71	37.71	88.47	88.47	88.47	91.04	91.04	91.04	ROUTE4C
30.00	17.00	6.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	96.33	96.33	96.33	96.33	96.33	96.33	ROUTE5
29.00	19.00	10.00	36.76	36.76	36.76	38.18	38.18	38.18	94.63	94.63	94.63	94.63	94.63	94.63	ROUTE5
17.00	19.00	10.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	90.90	90.90	90.90	90.90	90.90	90.90	ROUTE6
29.00	19.00	10.00	16.10	21.47	25.76	18.79	24.69	28.99	75.44	80.80	85.10	78.12	84.02	88.32	ROUTE6
25.00	19.00	10.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	95.56	95.56	95.56	95.56	95.56	95.56	ROUTE7A
29.00	17.00	6.00	37.26	37.26	37.26	36.22	36.22	36.22	88.26	88.26	88.26	88.26	88.26	88.26	ROUTE7C
30.00	19.00	10.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	40.00	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	99.67	ROUTE7C

Whitney Smith 7/05/16