

From: Jeff Siebler, Committee Chair

To: Whitney Smith (wesmith@uark.edu)

Date: March 21, 2017

Subject: Summary — RFP 600989, Enterprise Energy Management System

Whitney,

The evaluation committee has completed the review and evaluation of proposals for Enterprise Energy Management System under RFP 600989. Proposals were received from the following vendors:

1. Buildigence
2. EnergyCAP Inc
3. Entronix
4. Johnson Controls
5. Lucid
6. Wade Co. (Schneider Electric)

After receiving the best and final offer responses, the evaluation committee discussed the various proposals to determine the best fit for the University. Following our discussion, I tallied final scores and updated the score sheet.

The committee recommends the award of Request for Enterprise Energy Management System (RFP 600989) to Johnson Controls. It was agreed that Lucid offered the best product. However, the committee selected Johnson Controls for two reasons:

1. The final score sheet showed JCI to be the best choice overall when accounting for all of the factors listed in the RFP, and
2. Cost, although a small part of the overall total, shifted the edge away from Lucid and toward JCI.

Evaluation forms and supporting documentation have been sent separately.

The committee wishes to thank each respondent for their interest in doing business with the University of Arkansas, and for their efforts in responding to the RFP.

Thank you for your assistance with this RFP process.

Best regards,

Jeff Siebler

Energy Manager

University of Arkansas

Enterprise Energy Management System RFP Proposal Evaluation Matrix

Evaluation Criteria Breakdown	Points	Johnson Controls	Lucid
Completeness of Response to RFP (Pass/Fail)			
ALL required schedules, forms and informational items have been submitted.	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass
A. Functionality, Service and Support	40 Points		
Features, system reliability and availability as outlined in Appendix C (Qualifications Questionnaire).	0-40		
Quality and approach of functional modules.			
Account management and customer service capabilities.			
Fault Detection and Diagnostics			
Reports and metrics.			
B. Security, Compliance and Integration	20 Points		
Adherences to industry best practices	0-20		
System security			
System integration capabilities			
C. Vendor Implementation and Maintenance	10 Points		
Vendor implementation plan and schedule	0-10		
Training			
Vendor support during implementation			
Vendor maintenance			
D. Vendor History and Past Performance	10 Points		
Team (organizational) qualifications and strengths for all partners: company overview and years in business. Strength of assigned team members years of prior experience in technical, project management and demonstrated track record of success for similar projects.	0-10		
Strength and relevance of references per RFP submittal requirements for all project phases. Minimum 3 references for successfully completed projects of similar size.			
E. Cost	20 Points	20	7
Cost points assigned on the specific component basis as reflected on the Official Price Sheet. The bid with lowest estimated cost of the overall system receives maximum points possible for this section. Remaining bids receive points in accordance with the following formula: (a/b)(c) = d a = lowest cost bid in dollars b = second (third, fourth, etc.) lowest cost bid c = maximum points for Cost category (20) d = number of points allocated to bid	0-20		
Startup Cost			
Annual Cost (First year, subject to escalation)			
Annual Cost (7 year total)			
Total (7 year total)			
F. Total			

Additional Comments and Considerations

Buildigence acts as project manager for Lucid (dashboards, reporting) and Ecorithm (FDD). Annual cost is Lucid plus Ecorithm. Will there be a markup?
 Johnson Controls - how customizable is Meter Analysis Tool?
 TME acts as project manager for Entronix. FDD is mentioned but needs clarification on its intended use.

Siebler JCI	Lucid	Nixon JCI	Lucid	Boles JCI	Lucid	Turley JCI	Lucid	Roberts JCI	Lucid	Total JCI	Lucid
89	85	81	71	80	81	89	86	83	82	422	407
33	39	28	24	30	34	32	39	30	38		
8	10	7	6	6	8	8	10	8	9		
8	10	7	6	6	8	8	10	8	10		
9	10	7	6	6	8	8	10	7	10		
8	9	7	6	4	8	8	9	7	9		
20	20	16	20	17	20	18	20	17	19		
6	7	6	7	6	6	6	7	6	7		
7	7	5	7	6	7	6	6	6	6		
7	6	5	6	5	7	6	7	5	6		
8	10	9	10	5	10	10	10	8	9		
2	2	3	3	1	2.5	3	2	2	2		
3	3	3	3	2	2.5	3	2	2	2		
1	3	2	2	1.5	2.5	2	3	2	3		
2	2	1	2	0.5	2.5	2	3	2	2		
8	9	8	10	8	10	9	10	8	9		
3	5	4	5	4	5	5	5	4	5		
5	4	4	5	4	5	4	5	4	4		
20	7	20	7	20	7	20	7	20	7		

Whitney Smith 5/11/17